Standards in semen examination: publishing reproducible and reliable data based on high-quality methodology


These authors contributed equally.

E Mail of corresponding author lars.bjorndahl@ki.se

Lars Björndahl,
Andrology Laboratory, ANOVA, Department of Medicine Huddinge, Karolinska Institutet
Karolinska University Hospital, Norra Stationsgatan 69
S-113 63 Stockholm, SWEDEN
ORCID: 0000-0002-4709-5807

Running title: Improvement of science based on semen examination

"Disclaimer: Some of the authors are present or former staff members of the World Health Organization. The authors alone are responsible for the views expressed in this publication and they do not necessarily represent the views, decisions, or policies of the institutions with which they are affiliated."
Improvement of science based on semen examination

Address and ORCID of authors.

Ashok Agarwal
Director, Global Andrology Forum
Professor of Surgery, Case Western Reserve University, Moreland Hills, OH, USA
ORCID: 0000-0003-0585-1026

Robert J Aitken
Priority Research Centre for Reproductive Science, Faculty of Science and Faculty of Health & Medicine, University of Newcastle, Callaghan, NSW, Australia.
ORCID: 0000-0002-9152-156X.

Juan G Alvarez
Centro Androgen, La Coruña, Spain, and Professor of Reproductive Biology, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA.
ORCID: 0000-0002-4851-9579.

Natalie Aneck-Hahn
Department of Urology, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa.
ORCID: 0000-0002-3649-8889.

Stefan Arver
ANOVA, Karolinska University Hospital & Karolinska Institutet, Stockholm, Sweden
ORCID: 0000-0002-2925-355X.

Elisabetta Baldi
Department of Experimental and Clinical Medicine, University of Florence, Italia.
ORCID: 0000-0003-1808-3097.

Christopher LR Barratt‡
Reproductive Medicine Research Group, Division of Systems Medicine, School of Medicine, Ninewells Hospital and Medical School, University of Dundee, Dundee, DD1 9SY, UK.
ORCID: 0000-0003-0062-9979.

Lluís Bassas
Laboratory of Andrology and Sperm Bank, Andrology Department, Fundació Puigvert, Barcelona, Spain.
ORCID: 0000-0002-3473-3611.

Lars Björndahl‡
ANOVA, Karolinska University Hospital and Karolinska Institutet, Norra Stationsgatan 69, S-113 64 Stockholm, Sweden.
ORCID: 0000-0002-4709-5807.

Florence Boitrelle
Department of Reproductive Biology, Fertility Preservation, Andrology, CECOS, Poissy Hospital, Poissy, France and Paris Saclay University, UVSQ, INRAE, BREED, Jouy-en-Josas, France.
ORCID 0000-0002-5322-0141.

Riana Bornman
School of Health Systems and Public Health, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa
ORCID: 0000-0003-3975-2333

Douglas T Carrell
Andrology and IVF Laboratory, Division of Urology, Department of Surgery, And Department of Human Genetics, University of Utah School of Medicine, Salt Lake City, UT, USA.
ORCID: 0000-0002-6471-2803.

José A Castilla
Improvement of science based on semen examination

Gerardo Cerezo Parra
Director of LAFER Sperm Bank, Tuxpan 10-606, Roma Sur, C.P. 06760, Cuauhtémoc,
Mexico City, Mexico.
ORCID: 0000-0003-4577-159X.

Gerardo Cerezo Parra
GAMETIA Biobank, Granada; Hospital Universitario Virgen de las Nieves and Instituto de
Investigación Biosanitaria ibs.GRANADA, Granada, Spain
ORCID: 0000-0003-2185-565X

Gerardo Cerezo Parra
ORCID: 0000-0003-2185-565X.

Jerome H. Check
ORCID: 0000-0002-2351-4595.

Patricia S Cuasnicu
Instituto de Biología y Medicina Experimental (IByme-CONICET), Ciudad Autónoma de Buenos Aires,
Buenos Aires, Argentina.
ORCID: 0000-0002-4784-488X.

Sally Perreault Darney
Cary, NC, USA (US EPA and US NIH, retired)
ORCID: 0000-0002-0315-1774.

Stefan S Du Plessis
College of Medicine, Mohammed Bin Rashid University of Medicine and Health Sciences, Dubai,
United Arab Emirates.
ORCID: 0000-0001-5495-3489.

Michael L. Eisenberg
Director, Male Reproductive Medicine and Surgery; Men’s Health, Professor Department of Urology,
Stanford University School of Medicine, USA.
ORCID: 0000-0001-5482-0141.

Sandro C. Esteves
ANDROFERT, Andrology and Human Reproduction Clinic, Campinas, SP, Brazil.
Department of Surgery (Division of Urology), University of Campinas (UNICAMP), Campinas, SP, Brazil
Faculty of Health, Aarhus University, 8000 Aarhus C, Denmark
ORCID: 0000-0002-1313-9680.

Evangelini A Evgeni
Improvement of science based on semen examination

CRYOGONIA Cryopreservation Bank, Athens, Greece
Department of Medicine, Laboratory of Physiology, Democritus University of Thrace, Greece
ORCID: 0000-0002-3909-9170

Alberto Ferlin
University of Padova, Department of Medicine, Unit of Andrology and Reproductive Medicine, Italy.
ORCID: 0000-0001-5817-8141

Nicolas Garrido
IVI Foundation, Health Research Institute La Fe, Valencia, Spain.
ORCID: 0000-0001-8271-5218.

Aleksander Giwercman
Dept. of Translational Medicine, Lund University, Malmo, Sweden
ORCID: 0000-0001-5816-0785

Ilse G.F. Goovaerts
Antwerp University Hospital, Drie Eikenstraat 655, B- 2650 Edegem, Belgium.
ORCID: 0000-0002-3563-8499

Trine B Haugen
Department of Life Sciences and Health, Oslo Metropolitan University, Oslo, Norway.
ORCID: 0000-0002-8814-3393

Ralf Henkel
Department of Metabolism, Digestion & Reproduction, Imperial College London, London, UK, and
Department of Medical Bioscience, University of the Western Cape, Bellville, South Africa.
ORCID: 0000-0003-1128-2982.

Lars Henningsohn
Division of urology, Dept of CLINTEC, Karolinska Institutet, Dept of urology, Karolinska University
Hospital
ORCID: 0000-0002-5521-8934.

Marie-Claude Hofmann
University of Texas MD Anderson Cancer Center, Department of Endocrine Neoplasia & Hormonal
Disorders, Houston, Texas, USA.
ORCID: 0000-0002-4899-8039.

James M Hotaling
Division of Urology, Department of Surgery, University of Utah School of Medicine, Salt Lake City, UT
84112, USA.
ORCID 0000-0002-4401-4565.

Piotr Jedrzejczak
Department of Cell Biology, Poznan University of Medical Science, Poland
ORCID: 0000-0003-2437-7737.

Pierre Jouannet
Université Paris Descartes, Paris, France
ORCID: 0000-0003-1827-8986

Niels Jørgensen
Department of Growth and Reproduction, Copenhagen University Hospital, Rigshospitalet,
Copenhagen, Denmark and International Center for Research and Research Training in Endocrine
Disruption of Male Reproduction and Child Health (EDMaRC), Copenhagen University Hospital,
Rigshospitalet, Copenhagen, Denmark.
ORCID: 0000-0003-4827-0838.
Impression of science based on semen examination

Jackson Kirkman Brown
Director Centre for Human Reproductive Science (ChRS), Reader in Healthcare Science, College of Medical & Dental Sciences, University of Birmingham and, Birmingham Women’s and Children’s NHS Foundation Trust, UK
ORCID: 0000-0003-2833-8970

Csilla Krausz
Department of Biomedical, Experimental and Clinical Sciences "Mario Serio", University of Florence, Florence, Italy.
ORCID: 0000-0001-6748-8918

Maciej Kurpisz
Institutet of Human Genetics, Department of Reproductive Biology and Stem Cells; Poznan, Poland
ORCID: 0000-0003-3275-3245.

Ulrik Kvist
ANOVA, Karolinska University Hospital & Karolinska Institutet, Stockholm, Sweden
ORCID: 0000-0001-7874-3427

Dolores J Lamb
Brady Department of Urology, Center for Reproductive Genomics and Englander Institute for Precision Medicine, Weill Cornell Medical College, Cornell University, New York, NY 10065, USA.
ORCID: 0000-0002-4389-5065.

Hagai Levine
Braun School of Public Health and Community Medicine, Hadassah Medical Center, The Faculty of Medicine, Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Ein Kerem Campus, POB 12272, Jerusalem, ZIP 91102, Israel.
ORCID: 0000-0002-5597-4916

Katherine Loveland
Hudson Institute Centre for Reproductive Health & Monash University, Clayton, VIC, Australia.
ORCID: 0000-0002-5750-8046.

Robert I McLachlan
Hudson Institute of Medical Research, Centre for Endocrinology and Metabolism, Monash University, Clayton, VIC, Australia
ORCID: 0000-0003-4637-3876

Ali Mahran
Dermatology and Andrology Department, Assiut University Hospital, and Faculty of Medicine, Assiut University, Assiut, Egypt.
ORCID: 0000-0001-7870-4110

Liana Maree
Department of Medical Bioscience, University of the Western Cape, Bellville, South Africa.
ORCID: 0000-0003-4147-4221.

Sarah Martins da Silva
Reproductive Medicine Research Group, Division of Systems Medicine, School of Medicine, Ninewells Hospital and Medical School, University of Dundee, Dundee, DD1 9SY, UK.
ORCID: 0000-0003-2579-4866.

Michael T. Mbizvo
Country Director, Population Council (International Programs)
ORCID: 0000-0001-8262-8640
Improvement of science based on semen examination

Andreas Meinhardt
Department of Anatomy and Cell Biology, Justus-Liebig-University of Giessen, Aulweg 123, 35385 Giessen, Germany.
ORCID: 0000-0003-3711-2746.

Roelof Menkveld (Retired)
Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, Stellenbosch University, Tygerberg, 7505, South Africa
ORCID: 0000-0002-2539-6852.

David Mortimer
Oooza Biomedical Inc, West Vancouver, BC, V7W 3G4, Canada.
ORCID: 0000-0002-0638-2893.

Sharon T Mortimer
Oooza Biomedical Inc, West Vancouver, BC, V7W 3G4 Canada, and Division of REI, Department of Obstetrics & Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, Canada
ORCID: 0000-0002-3498-5667

Sergey Moskovtsev
Department of Laboratory Medicine & Pathobiology, University of Toronto, and Andrology Director, CReATe Fertility Centre, Toronto, Ontario, Canada.
ORCID: 0000-0003-1303-6048.

Charles H Muller
Male Fertility Laboratory, Department of Urology, University of Washington School of Medicine, Seattle, WA, USA.
ORCID: 0000-0003-1593-2073.

Maria José Munuce
Laboratorio de Medicina Reproductiva, Facultad de Ciencias Bioquímicas y Farmacéuticas, Universidad Nacional de Rosario, Argentina.
ORCID: 0000-0001-6919-7698

Monica Muratori
Department of Biomedical, Experimental and Clinical Sciences "Mario Serio", University of Florence, Florence, Italy
ORCID: 0000-0003-0925-0009.

Craig Niederberger
Clarence C. Saelhof Professor and Head, Department of Urology, UIUC College of Medicine Professor, Department of Bioengineering, UIUC College of Engineering, Illinois, USA.
ORCID: 0000-0003-1691-7289

Cristian O’Flaherty
Department of Surgery (Urology Division), McGill University, Montréal, QC H4A 3J1, Canada.
ORCID: 0000-0001-8884-1274.

Rafael Oliva
Molecular Biology of Reproduction and Development group, Biomedical Research Institute August Pi I Sunyer (IDIBAPS), University of Barcelona, and Hospital Clinic, Barcelona, Spain.
ORCID: 0000-0003-4876-2410.

Willem Ombelet
Genk Institute for Fertility Technology, and Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, ZOL Hospitals and Hasselt University, Genk, Belgium.
ORCID: 0000-0002-7206-1537.
Improvement of science based on semen examination

Allan A Pacey
Department of Oncology and Metabolism, Head of Departments of Oncology and Metabolism and Infection, Immunity and Cardiovascular Disease, University of Sheffield, S10 2RX, UK.
ORCID: 0000-0002-4387-8871.

Michael A. Palladino
Vice President for Academic Affairs and Dean of Faculty, Bloomfield College, BLOOMFIELD, NJ, USA
ORCID: 0000-0002-4687-7612

Ranjith Ramasamy
Department of Urology, Miller School of Medicine, University of Miami, Miami, FL, USA.
ORCID: 0000-0003-1387-7904.

Dr. Liliana Ramos
ORCID: 0000-0002-4269-013X

Nathalie Rives
Chef du Service Laboratoire de Biologie de la Reproduction-CECOS, Equipe Physiopathologie Surrénaillenne et Gonadique, Unité Inserm 1239 NorDic, CHU-Hôpitaux de Rouen, UFR Santé - Université de Rouen, 76031 Rouen cedex, France.
ORCID: 0000-0001-9102-1111

Eduardo RS Roldan
Department of Biodiversity and Evolutionary Biology, Museo Nacional de Ciencias Naturales (CSIC), Madrid, Spain.
ORCID: 0000-0002-7545-4248

Susan Rothmann
Laboratory Director, Fertility Solutions Inc, Warrensville Heights, OH, USA.
ORCID: 0000-0002-9738-0913

Denny Sakkas
Chief Scientific Officer, Boston IVF, Boston, MA, USA.
ORCID: 0000-0002-9509-6791.

Andrea Salonia
University Vita-Salute San Raffaele, Milan & Division of Experimental Oncology/Unit of Urology; URI; IRCCS Ospedale San Raffaele, Milan, Italy.
ORCID: 0000-0002-0595-7165

Maria Cristina Sánchez-Pozo
Department of Clinical Chemistry and Molecular Biology, Virgen del Rocío University Hospital, Seville, Spain
ORCID: 0000-0002-4908-8758

Rosanna Sapiro
Profesor Agregado, Depto de Histologia y Embriología, Facultad de Medicina, Gral. Flores 2125, Uruguay
ORCID: 0000-0002-9755-9016

Stefan Schlatt
Director, Centre of Reproductive Medicine and Andrology, Albert-Schweitzer Campus 1, Building D11 48149 Münster, Germany.
ORCID: 0000-0002-7571-5313

Peter N. Schlegel
Improvement of science based on semen examination

Laboratory of Histology-Embryology, Medical School, University of Athens
ORCID: 0000-0002-5241-9845

Armand Zini
Division of Urology, Department of Surgery, St Mary’s Hospital, McGill University, Montreal, Québec, Canada
ORCID 0000-0002-2194-5578
Abstract
Biomedical science is rapidly developing into more transparency, openness and reproducibility of scientific publications. This is even more important for all studies that are based on results from basic semen examination. Recently two concordant documents have been published: The 6th edition of the WHO Laboratory Manual for the Examination and Processing of Human Semen and the International Standard ISO 23162:2021. With these tools we propose that authors should be instructed to follow these laboratory methods in order to publish studies in peer-reviewed journals, preferably by using a checklist as suggested in an Appendix to this paper.

Key words: Reproducibility, Basic Semen Examination, Standardized Laboratory Procedures, Andrology, Reproductive Medicine, Laboratory Training, Quality Control, Patient Security, Science Development, Journal Requirements.

Appeal to the Scientific Society involved in Andrology and Reproductive Medicine
As scientists are aware, there has been much discussion about the transparency, openness, and reproducibility of science. This is not a new issue. Ten years ago, Begley and Ellis proposed a series of recommendations to improve the reliability of studies in preclinical cancer research (Begley and Ellis, 2012) that helped initiate a series of developments to address and improve reproducibility. These have included more detailed reporting and transparency of methods such as the STAR Methods for Cell Press journals https://www.cell.com/star-authors-guide. Concomitant with these developments, national programs such as The MDAR (Materials Design Analysis Reporting) Framework for transparent reporting in the life sciences have been launched (Macleod, et al., 2021), and specific consortia have been developed to repeat key published experiments e.g. Reproducibility Project: Cancer Biology (RP:CB) (https://elifesciences.org/collections/9b1e83d1/reproducibility-project-cancer-biology) (Rodgers and Collings, 2021). Furthermore, there are significant resources available such as EQUATOR guidelines (https://www.equator-network.org/). The clear direction of travel is to improve standards and have transparent reporting of research (Amara, 2022). There are challenges,
Improvement of science based on semen examination

however. For example, in the RP:CB project insufficient information was available to repeat selected experiments published in high impact journals. Furthermore, in the experiments that could be repeated (50/193), fewer than half yielded similar results. As such the final report of the RP:CB consortia suggested that ‘it is hard to assess whether reported findings are credible’ (Errington, et al., 2021).

In our own discipline of Andrology and Reproductive Medicine, there is a plethora of evidence to show that using non-standardized methods produces unreliable data, e.g., for human sperm concentration and sperm motility assessments. This has created significant problems for the field, making it difficult to determine the scientific accuracy of many studies and ultimately establish their real clinical and public health impact. A recent example of this is the study of Campbell and colleagues where they updated the WHO semen analysis distribution values (Campbell, et al., 2021). The authors reported several challenges obtaining key information of the quality of the semen examination methods used across the studies being considered for inclusion. Standardization of semen examination has been a long-standing issue that the profession has collectively failed to address, despite the availability of proven accurate methods and robust training approaches (Barratt, et al., 2011, Björndahl, et al., 2002, Björndahl, et al., 2016, Cairo Consensus Workshop, 2020, Carrell and De Jonge, 2016). Too many studies depending on semen analysis derived data continue to demonstrate poor robustness and rigour in semen analysis methodology (Serrano, et al., 2014).

When methods with a high degree of uncertainty are used, differences between normal and pathological conditions are likely to be impossible to discover since each observation, burdened by large variability due to measurement uncertainty, will have a more-or-less random result. This will cause considerable overlap in results from the different populations, making them practically inseparable.

The question for all of us working in Andrology, including Editors of journals publishing research in this field, is: What can be done to improve the situation? We believe there is currently a window of
opportunity for action. The recent publication of ISO Standard 23162 for the basic examination of human semen (International Organization for Standardization, 2021) finally means that the field has de facto reference methods. These methods form the basis of those recommended in the new, 6th edition of the WHO andrology laboratory manual (World Health Organization, 2021), which contains simple to follow and proven high-quality methods for semen examination. We propose that authors should be instructed to follow these laboratory methods in order to publish studies in peer-reviewed journals. To facilitate this, we present an author checklist, modified from Björndahl and colleagues (2016, Figure 1), which authors can complete and submit with their manuscript, making it simple for the journals, reviewers and readers alike to assess the quality of the semen assessment methods used, and hence of the data being reported. We suggest that any deviation from the checklist, for purposes of testing a new reagent, different method or procedure for improving on the performance of a current recommendation, should be specified and measured against those in the checklist. If authors did not follow these methods, a separate section of the Materials and Methods should specify what differed and why, and how the variations might have impacted the accuracy of results. In other disciplines checklists have assisted with improving the reporting of results (Nature, 2018, Npqip Collaborative group, 2019). This approach is consistent with the TOP Guidelines (Transparency and Openness Promotion; Centre for Open Science https://www.cos.io/initiatives/top-guidelines) (Nosek, et al., 2015).

This is an important initiative. We suggest it be implemented by all journals in our discipline to help improve the transparency, openness, and reproducibility of science.

Data availability statement
No new data were generated or included in the manuscript

Declaration of Authors' roles
LB, CB, and DM outlined the first manuscript and contacted all other authors for comments. LB, CB, and DM summarized all suggestions and finalized the manuscript that all authors have received and confirmed their participation in.
Funding statement

No specific funding was used for this publication.

Conflict of Interest Statement

This is an Opinion Paper based on the necessity for improvement of standards in the field of Andrology and Reproductive Medicine, based on the two non-profit publications, by the World Health Organization and the International Organization for Standardization. No conflicts of interest are declared. CB, as an employee of the University of Dundee, serves on the Scientific Advisory board of ExSeed Health (from October 2021, financial compensation to the University of Dundee) and is a scientific consultant for Exscientia (from September 2021, financial compensation to the University of Dundee). CB has previously received a fee from Cooper Surgical for lectures on scientific research methods outside the submitted work (2020) and Ferring for a lecture on male reproductive health (2021). CB is Editor for Reproductive Bio Medicine On-line.

Barratt CL, Björndahl L, Menkveld R, Mortimer D. ESHRE special interest group for andrology basic semen analysis course: a continued focus on accuracy, quality, efficiency and clinical relevance.


Legend to Appendix:

Proposed checklist for authors, reviewers, and editors (Modified from Björndahl et al., 2016).